

1 LUBIN AND ENOCH, P.C.  
2 Stanley Lubin (AZ 003076)  
3 349 North 4th Avenue  
4 Phoenix, Arizona 85003-1505  
5 Telephone: (602) 234-0008  
Facsimile: (602) 626-3586  
Email: Stan@lubinandenoch.com

6 STUMPHAUZER, O'TOOLE, McLAUGHLIN,  
7 McGlamery & Loughman Co., LPA  
Matthew A. Dooley (OH 0081482)  
8 Anthony R. Pecora (OH 0069660)  
Dennis M. O'Toole (OH 0003274)  
9 5455 Detroit Road  
Sheffield Village, Ohio 44054  
10 Telephone: (440) 930-4001  
11 Facsimile: (440) 934-7208  
12 Email: mdooley@sheffieldlaw.com  
apecora@sheffieldlaw.com  
dotoole@sheffieldlaw.com

14 CONSUMER LITIGATION ASSOCIATES, P.C.  
15 Leonard A. Bennett (VA 27523)  
16 Susan M. Rotkis (VA 40693)  
763 J. Clyde Morris Blvd. 1-A  
17 Newport News, Virginia 23601  
Telephone: (757) 930-3660  
18 Facsimile: (757) 930-3662  
Email: lenbennett@clalegal.com  
srotkis@clalegal.com

20  
21 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA

22  
23 KELVIN D. DANIEL, et al.

24 Plaintiffs,

25 v.

26 SWIFT TRANSPORTATION CO.  
27 OF ARIZONA, LLC  
28 Defendant.

Case No. 2:11-cv-01548-PHX-ROS

**PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR LEAVE  
TO FILE SECOND AMENDED  
COMPLAINT**

Assigned to: Hon. Roslyn O. Silver

1 Now come the Plaintiffs, Kelvin Daniel and Tanna Hodges, on behalf of  
2 themselves and all other similarly situated individuals, and respectfully moves the Court  
3 for leave to file their Second Amended Class Action Complaint (attached as Exhibit A)  
4 pursuant to Civ.R.15(a)(2) and Civ.R.15(c). A supporting memorandum is attached hereto  
5 and incorporated herein.

6  
7 Respectfully submitted,  
8  
9 STUMPHAUZER, O'TOOLE, McLAUGHLIN,  
10 McGLAMERY & LOUGHMAN CO., LPA  
11  
12 By: /s/ Matthew A. Dooley  
13 Matthew A. Dooley (admitted pro hac vice)  
14 Dennis M. O'Toole (admitted pro hac vice)  
15 Anthony R. Pecora (admitted pro hac vice)  
16 5455 Detroit Road  
17 Sheffield Village, Ohio 44054  
18 Telephone: (440) 930-4001  
19 Facsimile: (440) 934-7208  
20 Email: mdooley@sheffieldlaw.com  
dotoole@sheffieldlaw.com  
apecora@sheffieldlaw.com  
21  
22 and  
23 CONSUMER LITIGATION ASSOCIATES,  
24 P.C.  
25  
26 /s/ Leonard A. Bennett  
27 Leonard A. Bennett (admitted pro hac vice)  
763 J. Clyde Morris Boulevard  
Suite 1A  
Newport News, Virginia 23601  
Telephone: (757) 930-3660  
Facsimile: (757) 930-3662  
Email: lenbennett@clalegal.com  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65  
66  
67  
68  
69  
70  
71  
72  
73  
74  
75  
76  
77  
78  
79  
80  
81  
82  
83  
84  
85  
86  
87  
88  
89  
90  
91  
92  
93  
94  
95  
96  
97  
98  
99  
100  
101  
102  
103  
104  
105  
106  
107  
108  
109  
110  
111  
112  
113  
114  
115  
116  
117  
118  
119  
120  
121  
122  
123  
124  
125  
126  
127  
128  
129  
130  
131  
132  
133  
134  
135  
136  
137  
138  
139  
140  
141  
142  
143  
144  
145  
146  
147  
148  
149  
150  
151  
152  
153  
154  
155  
156  
157  
158  
159  
160  
161  
162  
163  
164  
165  
166  
167  
168  
169  
170  
171  
172  
173  
174  
175  
176  
177  
178  
179  
180  
181  
182  
183  
184  
185  
186  
187  
188  
189  
190  
191  
192  
193  
194  
195  
196  
197  
198  
199  
200  
201  
202  
203  
204  
205  
206  
207  
208  
209  
210  
211  
212  
213  
214  
215  
216  
217  
218  
219  
220  
221  
222  
223  
224  
225  
226  
227  
228  
229  
230  
231  
232  
233  
234  
235  
236  
237  
238  
239  
240  
241  
242  
243  
244  
245  
246  
247  
248  
249  
250  
251  
252  
253  
254  
255  
256  
257  
258  
259  
260  
261  
262  
263  
264  
265  
266  
267  
268  
269  
270  
271  
272  
273  
274  
275  
276  
277  
278  
279  
280  
281  
282  
283  
284  
285  
286  
287  
288  
289  
290  
291  
292  
293  
294  
295  
296  
297  
298  
299  
300  
301  
302  
303  
304  
305  
306  
307  
308  
309  
310  
311  
312  
313  
314  
315  
316  
317  
318  
319  
320  
321  
322  
323  
324  
325  
326  
327  
328  
329  
330  
331  
332  
333  
334  
335  
336  
337  
338  
339  
340  
341  
342  
343  
344  
345  
346  
347  
348  
349  
350  
351  
352  
353  
354  
355  
356  
357  
358  
359  
360  
361  
362  
363  
364  
365  
366  
367  
368  
369  
370  
371  
372  
373  
374  
375  
376  
377  
378  
379  
380  
381  
382  
383  
384  
385  
386  
387  
388  
389  
390  
391  
392  
393  
394  
395  
396  
397  
398  
399  
400  
401  
402  
403  
404  
405  
406  
407  
408  
409  
410  
411  
412  
413  
414  
415  
416  
417  
418  
419  
420  
421  
422  
423  
424  
425  
426  
427  
428  
429  
430  
431  
432  
433  
434  
435  
436  
437  
438  
439  
440  
441  
442  
443  
444  
445  
446  
447  
448  
449  
450  
451  
452  
453  
454  
455  
456  
457  
458  
459  
460  
461  
462  
463  
464  
465  
466  
467  
468  
469  
470  
471  
472  
473  
474  
475  
476  
477  
478  
479  
480  
481  
482  
483  
484  
485  
486  
487  
488  
489  
490  
491  
492  
493  
494  
495  
496  
497  
498  
499  
500  
501  
502  
503  
504  
505  
506  
507  
508  
509  
510  
511  
512  
513  
514  
515  
516  
517  
518  
519  
520  
521  
522  
523  
524  
525  
526  
527  
528  
529  
530  
531  
532  
533  
534  
535  
536  
537  
538  
539  
540  
541  
542  
543  
544  
545  
546  
547  
548  
549  
550  
551  
552  
553  
554  
555  
556  
557  
558  
559  
560  
561  
562  
563  
564  
565  
566  
567  
568  
569  
570  
571  
572  
573  
574  
575  
576  
577  
578  
579  
580  
581  
582  
583  
584  
585  
586  
587  
588  
589  
590  
591  
592  
593  
594  
595  
596  
597  
598  
599  
600  
601  
602  
603  
604  
605  
606  
607  
608  
609  
610  
611  
612  
613  
614  
615  
616  
617  
618  
619  
620  
621  
622  
623  
624  
625  
626  
627  
628  
629  
630  
631  
632  
633  
634  
635  
636  
637  
638  
639  
640  
641  
642  
643  
644  
645  
646  
647  
648  
649  
650  
651  
652  
653  
654  
655  
656  
657  
658  
659  
660  
661  
662  
663  
664  
665  
666  
667  
668  
669  
670  
671  
672  
673  
674  
675  
676  
677  
678  
679  
680  
681  
682  
683  
684  
685  
686  
687  
688  
689  
690  
691  
692  
693  
694  
695  
696  
697  
698  
699  
700  
701  
702  
703  
704  
705  
706  
707  
708  
709  
710  
711  
712  
713  
714  
715  
716  
717  
718  
719  
720  
721  
722  
723  
724  
725  
726  
727  
728  
729  
730  
731  
732  
733  
734  
735  
736  
737  
738  
739  
740  
741  
742  
743  
744  
745  
746  
747  
748  
749  
750  
751  
752  
753  
754  
755  
756  
757  
758  
759  
760  
761  
762  
763  
764  
765  
766  
767  
768  
769  
770  
771  
772  
773  
774  
775  
776  
777  
778  
779  
780  
781  
782  
783  
784  
785  
786  
787  
788  
789  
790  
791  
792  
793  
794  
795  
796  
797  
798  
799  
800  
801  
802  
803  
804  
805  
806  
807  
808  
809  
8010  
8011  
8012  
8013  
8014  
8015  
8016  
8017  
8018  
8019  
8020  
8021  
8022  
8023  
8024  
8025  
8026  
8027  
8028  
8029  
8030  
8031  
8032  
8033  
8034  
8035  
8036  
8037  
8038  
8039  
8040  
8041  
8042  
8043  
8044  
8045  
8046  
8047  
8048  
8049  
8050  
8051  
8052  
8053  
8054  
8055  
8056  
8057  
8058  
8059  
8060  
8061  
8062  
8063  
8064  
8065  
8066  
8067  
8068  
8069  
8070  
8071  
8072  
8073  
8074  
8075  
8076  
8077  
8078  
8079  
8080  
8081  
8082  
8083  
8084  
8085  
8086  
8087  
8088  
8089  
8090  
8091  
8092  
8093  
8094  
8095  
8096  
8097  
8098  
8099  
80100  
80101  
80102  
80103  
80104  
80105  
80106  
80107  
80108  
80109  
80110  
80111  
80112  
80113  
80114  
80115  
80116  
80117  
80118  
80119  
80120  
80121  
80122  
80123  
80124  
80125  
80126  
80127  
80128  
80129  
80130  
80131  
80132  
80133  
80134  
80135  
80136  
80137  
80138  
80139  
80140  
80141  
80142  
80143  
80144  
80145  
80146  
80147  
80148  
80149  
80150  
80151  
80152  
80153  
80154  
80155  
80156  
80157  
80158  
80159  
80160  
80161  
80162  
80163  
80164  
80165  
80166  
80167  
80168  
80169  
80170  
80171  
80172  
80173  
80174  
80175  
80176  
80177  
80178  
80179  
80180  
80181  
80182  
80183  
80184  
80185  
80186  
80187  
80188  
80189  
80190  
80191  
80192  
80193  
80194  
80195  
80196  
80197  
80198  
80199  
80200  
80201  
80202  
80203  
80204  
80205  
80206  
80207  
80208  
80209  
80210  
80211  
80212  
80213  
80214  
80215  
80216  
80217  
80218  
80219  
80220  
80221  
80222  
80223  
80224  
80225  
80226  
80227  
80228  
80229  
80230  
80231  
80232  
80233  
80234  
80235  
80236  
80237  
80238  
80239  
80240  
80241  
80242  
80243  
80244  
80245  
80246  
80247  
80248  
80249  
80250  
80251  
80252  
80253  
80254  
80255  
80256  
80257  
80258  
80259  
80260  
80261  
80262  
80263  
80264  
80265  
80266  
80267  
80268  
80269  
80270  
80271  
80272  
80273  
80274  
80275  
80276  
80277  
80278  
80279  
80280  
80281  
80282  
80283  
80284  
80285  
80286  
80287  
80288  
80289  
80290  
80291  
80292  
80293  
80294  
80295  
80296  
80297  
80298  
80299  
80200  
80201  
80202  
80203  
80204  
80205  
80206  
80207  
80208  
80209  
80210  
80211  
80212  
80213  
80214  
80215  
80216  
80217  
80218  
80219  
80220  
80221  
80222  
80223  
80224  
80225  
80226  
80227  
80228  
80229  
80230  
80231  
80232  
80233  
80234  
80235  
80236  
80237  
80238  
80239  
80240  
80241  
80242  
80243  
80244  
80245  
80246  
80247  
80248  
80249  
80250  
80251  
80252  
80253  
80254  
80255  
80256  
80257  
80258  
80259  
80260  
80261  
80262  
80263  
80264  
80265  
80266  
80267  
80268  
80269  
80270  
80271  
80272  
80273  
80274  
80275  
80276  
80277  
80278  
80279  
80280  
80281  
80282  
80283  
80284  
80285  
80286  
80287  
80288  
80289  
80290  
80291  
80292  
80293  
80294  
80295  
80296  
80297  
80298  
80299  
80200  
80201  
80202  
80203  
80204  
80205  
80206  
80207  
80208  
80209  
80210  
80211  
80212  
80213  
80214  
80215  
80216  
80217  
80218  
80219  
80220  
80221  
80222  
80223  
80224  
80225  
80226  
80227  
80228  
80229  
80230  
80231  
80232  
80233  
80234  
80235  
80236  
80237  
80238  
80239  
80240  
80241  
80242  
80243  
80244  
80245  
80246  
80247  
80248  
80249  
80250  
80251  
80252  
80253  
80254  
80255  
80256  
80257  
80258  
80259  
80260  
80261  
80262  
80263  
80264  
80265  
80266  
80267  
80268  
80269  
80270  
80271  
80272  
80273  
80274  
80275  
80276  
80277  
80278  
80279  
80280  
80281  
80282  
80283  
80284  
80285  
80286  
80287  
80288  
80289  
80290  
80291  
80292  
80293  
80294  
80295  
80296  
80297  
80298  
80299  
80200  
80201  
80202  
80203  
80204  
80205  
80206  
80207  
80208  
80209  
80210  
80211  
80212  
80213  
80214  
80215  
80216  
80217  
80218  
80219  
80220  
80221  
80222  
80223  
80224  
80225  
80226  
80227  
80228  
80229  
80230  
80231  
80232  
80233  
80234  
80235  
80236  
80237  
80238  
80239  
80240  
80241  
80242  
80243  
80244  
80245  
80246  
80247  
80248  
80249  
80250  
80251  
80252  
80253  
80254  
80255  
80256  
80257  
80258  
80259  
80260  
80261  
80262  
80263  
80264  
80265  
80266  
80267  
80268  
80269  
80270  
80271  
80272  
80273  
80274  
80275  
80276  
80277  
80278  
80279  
80280  
80281  
80282  
80283  
80284  
80285  
80286  
80287  
80288  
80289  
80290  
80291  
80292  
80293  
80294  
80295  
80296  
80297  
80298  
80299  
80200  
80201  
80202  
80203  
80204  
80205  
80206  
80207  
80208  
80209  
80210  
80211  
80212  
80213  
80214  
80215  
80216  
80217  
80218  
80219  
80220  
80221  
80222  
80223  
80224  
80225  
80226  
80227  
80228  
80229  
80230  
80231  
80232  
80233  
80234  
80235  
80236  
80237  
80238  
80239  
80240  
80241  
80242  
80243  
80244  
80245  
80246  
80247  
80248  
80249  
80250  
80251  
80252  
80253  
80254  
80255  
80256  
80257  
80258  
80259  
80260  
80261  
80262  
80263  
80264  
80265  
80266  
80267  
80268  
80269  
80270  
80271  
80272  
80273  
80274  
80275  
80276  
80277  
80278  
80279  
80280  
80281  
80282  
80283  
80284  
80285  
80286  
80287  
80288  
80289  
80290  
80291  
80292  
80293  
80294  
80295  
80296  
80297  
80298  
80299  
80200  
80201  
80202  
80203  
80204  
80205  
80206  
80207  
80208  
80209  
80210  
80211  
80212  
80213  
80214  
80215  
80216  
80217  
80218  
80219  
80220  
80221  
80222  
80223  
80224  
80225  
80226  
80227  
80228  
80229  
80230  
80231  
80232  
80233  
80234  
80235  
80236  
80237  
80238  
80239  
80240  
80241  
80242  
80243  
80244  
80245  
80246  
80247  
80248  
80249  
80250  
80251  
80252  
80253  
80254  
80255  
80256  
80257  
80258  
80259  
80260  
80261  
80262  
80263  
80264  
80265  
80266  
80267  
80268  
80269  
80270  
80271  
80272  
80273  
80274  
80275  
80276  
80277  
80278  
80279  
80280  
80281  
80282  
80283  
80284  
80285  
80286  
80287  
80288  
80289  
80290  
80291  
80292  
80293  
80294  
80295  
80296  
80297  
80298  
80299  
80200  
80201  
80202  
80203  
80204  
80205  
80206  
80207  
80208  
80209  
80210  
80211  
80212  
80213  
80214  
80215  
80216  
80217  
80218  
80219  
80220  
80221  
80222  
80223  
80224  
80225  
80226  
80227  
80228  
80229  
80230  
80231  
80232  
80233  
80234  
80235  
80236  
80237  
80238  
80239  
80240  
80241  
80242  
80243  
80244  
80245  
80246  
80247  
80248  
80249  
80250  
80251  
80252  
80253  
80254  
80255  
80256  
80257  
80258  
80259  
80260  
80261  
80262  
80263  
80264  
80265  
80266  
80267  
80268  
80269  
80270  
80271  
80272  
80273  
80274  
80275  
80276  
80277  
80278  
80279  
80280  
80281  
80282  
80283  
80284  
80285  
80286  
80287  
80288  
80289  
80290  
80291  
80292  
80293  
80294  
80295  
80296  
80297  
80298  
80299  
80200  
80201  
80202  
80203  
80204  
80205  
80206  
80207  
80208  
80209  
80210  
80211  
80212  
80213  
80214  
80215  
80216  
80217  
80218  
80219  
80220  
80221  
80222  
80223  
80224  
80225  
80226  
80227  
80228  
80229  
80230  
80231  
80232  
80233  
80234  
80235  
80236  
80237  
80238  
80239  
80240  
80241  
80242  
80243  
80244  
80245  
80246  
80247  
80248  
80249  
80250  
80251  
80252  
80253  
80254  
80255  
80256  
80257  
80258  
80259  
80260  
80261  
80262  
80263  
80264  
80265  
80266  
80267  
80268  
80269  
80270  
80271  
80272  
80273  
80274  
80275  
80276  
80277  
80278  
80279  
80280  
80281  
80282  
80283  
80284  
80285  
80286  
80287  
80288  
80289  
80290  
80291  
80292  
80293  
80294  
80295  
80296  
80297  
80298  
80299  
80200  
80201  
80202  
80203  
80204  
80205  
80206  
80207  
80208  
80209  
80210  
80211  
80212  
80213  
80214  
80215  
80216  
80217

---

1

2

3 **MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT**

4

5 **I. OVERVIEW**

6 Contemporaneously with the filing of their Motion for Class Certification,  
7 Plaintiffs Hodges and Daniel also move the Court for leave to file their Second Amended  
8 Complaint in order to dismiss two of the four counts that the named Plaintiffs now believe  
9 they themselves cannot prosecute on behalf of classes in which they are not members. The  
10 class definitions and time periods set forth in Plaintiff's proposed Second Amended  
11 Complaint are greatly narrowed and more cleanly defined. Plaintiffs seek leave to amend  
12 their complaint in order to conform same to the evidence. No new claims are alleged. No  
13 factual allegations not already fully known to and subjected to discovery by Defendant are  
14 added. Nevertheless, the proposed Second Amended Complaint will greatly simplify the  
15 case and the Court's consideration of Plaintiff's Motion for Class Certification.

16 **II. PROCEDURAL BACKGROUND**

17 Kelvin Daniel, Tanna Hodges and Robert Bell<sup>1</sup> filed their Class Action Complaint  
18 (ECF 1) on August 8, 2011 alleging that Swift Transportation Corporation ("Swift")<sup>2</sup>  
19 failed to provide a clear, conspicuous, and stand-alone disclosure to in-person job  
20 applicants (initially inclusive of Hodges and Daniel) that consumer reports would be used  
21 for employment purposes in violation of the Fair Credit Reporting Act ("FCRA"), 15

---

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

<sup>1</sup> Bell was later dismissed voluntarily from the herein action.

<sup>2</sup> Swift later advised that its corporate name had changed to Swift Transportation Co. of Arizona, LLC. The proposed Second Amended Complaint names Swift Transportation Co. of Arizona, LLC as the proper defendant.

1 U.S.C. § 1681b(b)(2). Consequently, Plaintiffs alleged that Swift procured these  
2 consumer reports without proper authorization from Hodges, Daniel and putative class  
3 members. Plaintiffs also alleged that Swift failed to provide pre-adverse action notice to  
4 said job applicants, including a copy of the applicants' criminal background report and a  
5 statement of the applicants' rights as required by 15 U.S.C. § 1681b(b)(3).

7 The Class Action Complaint also alleged that Robert Bell applied for employment  
8 with Swift by facsimile pursuant and was thus entitled to rights afforded under 15 U.S.C.  
9 § 1681b(b)(2)(B). The Complaint asserted that Swift failed to provide Bell and putative  
10 class members with notice of their right to obtain a free copy of a consumer background  
11 report from the consumer reporting agency ("CRA") within 60 days, and to dispute the  
12 accuracy or the completeness of any information in the consumer report directly with the  
13 consumer reporting agency as required by 15 U.S.C. § 1681b(b)(3)(B) prior to obtaining  
14 consumer reports. As non-in-person applicants, the Complaint stated that Swift failed to,  
15 within 3 days of taking adverse action, provide Bell and putative class members with  
16 notification: (1) that adverse action has been taken based in whole or in part on a  
17 consumer report; with the name, address and phone number of the CRA; (2) with notice  
18 that the CRA did not make the decision to take adverse action; (3) notice that the applicant  
19 may request and receive a free copy of the report and may dispute the accuracy and  
20 completeness of any information in the report; and (4) receive from Swift a free copy of  
21 the report it procured along with a copy of the applicant's consumer rights as prescribed  
22 by the FTC under 15 U.S.C. § 1681g(c)(3), all in violation of 15 U.S.C. § 1681b(b)(3)(B).  
23 These allegations were re-asserted in Plaintiff's First Amended Complaint (ECF 19) filed  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 on October 24, 2011.

2       Over the nine months of discovery, Swift has produced over one million pages of  
3 documents pertaining to job applicants, their practices and procedures and other matters  
4 pertaining (and not pertaining) to this action. Over the same period, the case has  
5 developed to reflect the events that surrounded each class representative's experience. For  
6 example, discovery revealed that Swift procured Daniel's consumer report prior to inviting  
7 him to attend Swift's orientation. Further, during the last phase of discovery, Hodges'  
8 application status became clearer and more salient. Though Hodges applied in-person on  
9 both September 29, 2009 (as alleged in the original Complaint) and on September 25,  
10 2009 (as alleged in the First Amended Complaint), she also applied online on December  
11 12, 2009. Hodges was questioned about all three application experiences during her June  
12 11, 2012 deposition. Through the discovery process, it was also determined that Swift did  
13 not procure Hodge's criminal background report until December 14, 2009, while  
14 processing her December 12, 2009 online application. This was most recently verified in  
15 Swift declarations provided to Plaintiffs counsel on September 11, 2012. *See* Declaration  
16 of Patricia Ramos. Swift denied Hodges December 12, 2009 application based in whole  
17 or in part on her background report.

18       As already alleged in the Original and First Amended Complaints, online  
19 applicants like Daniel and Hodges and all non-in-person truck driver applicants, were not  
20 provided with notices mandated by 15 U.S.C. § 1681b(b)(2)(B) prior to Swift's  
21 procurement of consumer reports for employment purposes. Also alleged in the Original  
22 and First Amended Complaints, online applicants like Daniel and Hodges and all non-in-  
23

1 person truck driver applicants, were not provided with notices as mandated by 15 U.S.C. §  
 2 1681b(b)(3)(B), after being declined employment based in whole or in part on the  
 3 criminal background reports.  
 4

5 The facts, as flushed out during the contentious and arduous discovery process,  
 6 demonstrate that Swift treated Hodges' and Daniel's online applications as the impetus to  
 7 its procurement of their consumer reports.. As such, justice requires that the Court permit  
 8 Hodges and Daniel to amend their complaint to conform to this evidence as alleged in the  
 9 attached proposed Second Amended Complaint. The amendment would not be prejudicial  
 10 to Swift as it pertains to existing class allegations and because Swift already deposed both  
 11 Hodges and Daniel regarding their respective application experiences.  
 12

13 **III. LAW AND ARGUMENT**

14 **A. Legal Standard**

15 Leave to amend pleadings "shall be freely given when justice so requires" *See*  
 16 *Bonin v. Calderon*, 59 F.3d 815, 845 (9th Cir. 1995) (noting that district court's "denial of  
 17 a motion for leave to amend pursuant to Rule 15(a) is reviewed for abuse of discretion and  
 18 in light of the strong public policy permitting amendment"); *see also Hardiman v.*  
 19 *Galaza*, 58 Fed. Appx. 708, 710 (9th Cir. Cal. 2003); *see also Lacey v. Maricopa*  
 20 *County*, 2012 U.S. App. LEXIS 18320 (9th Cir. Ariz. Aug. 29, 2012). "When considering  
 21 a motion for leave to amend, a district court must consider whether the proposed  
 22 amendment results from undue delay, is made in bad faith, will cause prejudice to the  
 23 opposing party, or is a dilatory tactic." *See Gilmore v. Djo Inc.*, 663 F. Supp. 2d 856, 862  
 24 (D. Ariz. 2009). Whether to grant leave to amend a complaint is in the district court's  
 25  
 26  
 27  
 28

1 discretion, "keeping in mind the strong policy in favor of allowing amendment, and  
 2 considering four factors: bad faith, undue delay, prejudice to the opposing party, and the  
 3 futility of amendment. *See Hotchkins v. Fleet Delivery Serv.*, 25 F. Supp. 2d 1141, 1150  
 4 (D. Or. 1998). Such prejudice is generally found when an amended pleading asserts new  
 5 theories of recovery or would require significant additional discovery. *See Cook v. Field*  
 6 *Packing Co.*, 2006 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 37364 at \*7 (W.D. Ky. May 31, 2006).  
 7 Furthermore, Rule 15 (a) also allows for the addition of new plaintiffs. *See Junior*  
 8 *Gallery, Ltd. v. Neptune Orient Line, Ltd.*, 1997 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 499, 1997 WL 26793,  
 9 \*2, (S.D.N.Y. Jan. 22, 1997).

12 **B. Swift will not be prejudiced by Plaintiffs' request.**

13       Granting Plaintiffs leave to amend their complaint would not prejudice Swift. In  
 14 fact, Swift has defended both Hodges' and Daniel's claims from the initial pleadings under  
 15 the theory that they did not have in-person contact with Swift prior to Swift's procurement  
 16 of their respective consumer reports. Rather Swift has argued that Hodges and Daniel  
 17 applied online and should thus fall within the purview of 15 U.S.C. § 1681b(b)(2)(B) and  
 18 15 U.S.C. § 1681b(b)(3)(B). Swift is not surprised by such narrowing and changes to the  
 19 formal complaint. Plaintiffs have provided their responses to discovery long ago stating  
 20 such claims. And Swift deposed both Hodges and Daniel under Swift's correct  
 21 assumption that it was defending the claims of each Plaintiff as a "not in person"  
 22 consumer. *See e.g.* Hodges Dep. pp. 182, 184.

23       Where a proposed amended complaint would not greatly alter the nature of  
 24 litigation and would not require defendants to undertake an entirely new course of  
 25

discovery, leave should be granted. *See McConnell v. Red Robin Int'l, Inc.*, 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 53942 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 17, 2012); *see also Thomas v. Davie*, 847 F.2d 771, 773 (11th Cir. 1988) (unless there is a substantial reason to deny leave to amend, the discretion of the district court is not broad enough to permit denial); *see also Heyl & Patterson Int'l, Inc. v. F.D. Rich Housing of the Virgin Islands, Inc.*, 663 F.2d 419, 425 (3d Cir. 1981) (in the absence of substantial prejudice, denial must be grounded in bad faith or dilatory motives, truly undue or unexplained delay, repeated failure to cure deficiency by amendments previously allowed or futility of amendment). Here, because Swift has always considered Hodges and Daniel to be online applicants, it cannot claim bad faith or unexplained delay.

#### IV. CONCLUSION

WHEREFORE, for the reasons as stated above, Plaintiffs respectfully request leave to file the attached proposed Second Amended Complaint.

Respectfully submitted,

STUMPHAUZER, O'TOOLE, McLAUGHLIN,  
McGLAMERY & LOUGHMAN CO., LPA

By: /s/ Matthew A. Dooley  
Matthew A. Dooley (admitted pro hac vice)  
Dennis M. O'Toole (admitted pro hac vice)  
Anthony R. Pecora (admitted pro hac vice)  
5455 Detroit Road  
Sheffield Village, Ohio 44054  
Telephone: (440) 930-4001  
Facsimile: (440) 934-7208  
Email: mdooley@sheffieldlaw.com  
dotoole@sheffieldlaw.com  
apecora@sheffieldlaw.com

and

1  
2 CONSUMER LITIGATION ASSOCIATES,  
3 P.C.  
4

5 /s/ Leonard A. Bennett  
6 Leonard A. Bennett (admitted pro hac vice)  
7 763 J. Clyde Morris Boulevard  
8 Suite 1A  
9 Newport News, Virginia 23601  
10 Telephone: (757) 930-3660  
11 Facsimile: (757) 930-3662  
12 Email: lenbennett@clalegal.com  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

10 *Counsel for Kelvin Daniel Tanna Lee Hodges  
11 and the putative Class*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

This will certify that a copy of the foregoing Plaintiff's Motion for Leave to File Second Amended Class Action Complaint was filed electronically this 1st day of October, 2012. Notice of this filing will be sent to all parties by operation of the Court's electronic filing system or via regular mail.

/s/ Matthew A. Dooley  
*Counsel for Daniel, Bell and the putative  
Class*